# Study of Entrepreneurial Research and Doctoral Dissertations in Indian Universities

Ganapathi Batthini\*and Kavita Saxena\*\*

Research is a systematic activity directed towards the discovery and development of an organized body of knowledge. The human urge for new areas of knowledge has developed a faculty for search or research in him. Research has now become an integral part, not only in academic pursuits but also for practical achievements in several facets of modern society. Administrators, managers, businessmen, industrialists, sociologists, economists, physical scientists, natural scientists and nuclear scientists would all advocate an extensive use of research for academic advancement. On the other hand practitioners like industrial engineers, physicians, surgeons, managers, salesmen and shareholders also emphasis on the great utility of research in their dayto-day work. It is a fact that no academic organization can progress without sufficient advancement in terms of latest research activities.

All subjects require continuous research support to develop as a discipline. Entrepreneurship has evolved as an inclusive phenomenon which comprehends both the start-up of new companies (New Enterprise Creation) as well as the carrying out of new strategic initiatives within existing business (Family Business Enterprises). Hence, Entrepreneurship, as an independent and vital discipline, needs constant improvement and development through research to advance the frontiers of knowledge and open up new avenues.

Various universities, in the mid of the 20th century, began research in entrepreneurship. Western research on entrepreneurship started during 1961 and Indian research on entrepreneurship during 1970s. This paper broadly tries to identify the Doctoral Dissertation (Ph.D) programmes in entrepreneurship carried out in various Indian universities in comparison to that of Social Sciences.

#### Objectives of the Study

The present study has been undertaken with the following objectives:

- To identify the nature and direction of entrepreneurship research from 2000 to 2015.
- To identify quantitative growth of entrepreneurship research as compared to social sciences.
- To identify the contribution of universities in awarding doctoral degrees in entrepreneurship.
- To find out state wise, gender wise and language wise distribution of research in entrepreneurship.

#### Source of Data and Limitations

The study has been taken up to highlight the research trends in entrepreneurship from 2000 to 2015 in Indian universities. The data has been collected from *University News*. This newsletter publishes periodically the data on theses accepted for the award of Ph.D degree.

The entire analysis and interpretation of the study is based on the data available in this newsletter. The study does not consider research work in entrepreneurship by Indian researchers and submitted to foreign universities. The study covers the period from 2000 to 2015 i.e., a period of sixteen years.

#### Methodology

As indicated earlier, the main source of data is University News, a weekly official publication of the Association of Indian Universities, New Delhi. It publishes the list of doctoral theses accepted by Indian universities in different disciplines. During the said period, 20271 Ph.D theses have been awarded in various disciplines of Social Sciences, out of which 177 doctoral theses have been awarded on entrepreneurship by Indian universities (see Appendix).

# **Analysis and Findings**

The research titles of theses form the primary database of this study. To get the possible view of the domain of doctoral education in entrepreneurship over a period of sixteen years, the data have been analyzed as follows.

<sup>&</sup>quot;Librarian, Entrepreneurship Development Institute of India, PO Bhat 382 428, Dist. Gandhinagar (Gujarat) ganapathi@ediindia.org

<sup>\*\*</sup> Associate Faculty, Entrepreneurship Development Institute of India, PO Bhat 382 428, Dist. Gandhinagar (Gujarat) kavita@ediindia.org

# Year Wise Distribution of PhD Theses on Entrepreneurship

Table 1 represents the year wise distribution of theses, which shows a total of 177 theses that have been awarded in Entrepreneurship during the last sixteen years. The highest number of theses, i.e., 16 (9.04%) was awarded in the year 2007, while the lowest number of six (3.39%) was awarded in 2000. During 2004, 2009 and 2010 the number of theses awarded is 14 (7.91%) in each year. It is observed that the Ph.D. theses awarded since 2013 has been reduced.

Table 1. Year Wise Distribution of PhD Theses on Entrepreneurship

Sl. No.	Year	No. of Theses	Percentage
1	2000	6	3.39
2	2001	7 - 1999	3.95
3	2002	12	6.78
4	2003	n	6.21
5	2004	14	7.91
6	2005	Here Here	6.21
7	2006	П	6.21
8	2007	16	9.04
9	2008	II man en	6.21
10	2009	14	7.91
11	2010	14	7.91
12	2011	11	6.21
13	2012	13	7.34
14	2013	10	5.65
15	2014	9	5.08
16	2015	7	3.95
111-12	Total	177	100.00

# Distribution of Theses on Entrepreneurship as Compared to Theses on Social Sciences

Table 2 shows a comparative analysis of distribution of theses in entrepreneurship as compared to theses in Social Sciences. It can be observed that during the last sixteen years the percentage of Ph.D theses awarded in entrepreneurship to that of social science is 14.31.

It compares the number of Ph.D theses in Entrepreneurship to the number of Ph.D theses in social science in a particular year. 2007 saw the highest number of theses (16) in Entrepreneurship, being awarded whereas the lowest i.e., 6 theses was in 2000. It can be noted that in 2008 number of theses awarded in the social sector is 1922 which includes only 11 theses in Entrepreneurship.

Table 2. Comparison of Ph.D Theses on Entrepreneurship and Social Sciences

St. No.	Year	No. Theses in Social Sciences	No. of Theses in Entre- preneurship	Per- centage
1	2000	926	6	0.65
2	2001	793	7	0.88
3	2002	1267	12	0.95
4	2003	1519	- 11	0.72
5	2004	1269	14	1.10
6	2005	1239	11	0.89
7	2006	1632	-11	0.67
8	2007	1501	16	1.07
9	2008	1922	11	0.57
10	2009	1319	14	1.06
11	2010	1639	14	0.85
12	2011	1349	11	0.82
13	2012	1428	13	0.91
14	2013	827	10	1.21
15	2014	938	9	0.96
16	2015	703	7	1.00
71	Total	20271	177	14.31

# University Wise Distribution of Ph.D Theses on Entrepreneurship

In order to ascertain the contribution of universities in India awarding Ph.D theses in Entrepreneurship during the last eleven years, an analysis has been made in Table 3. Out of 740 recognized universities (which include Central Universities, State Universities, Deemed Universities, Private Universities and Autonomous Institutes) in India, only 66 universities have awarded Ph.D in Entrepreneurship. It shows that only 8.92 percentage

Table 3. University Wise Distribution of Ph.D Theses on Entrepreneurship

SI. No.	Name of the University	No. of Theses	Percentage
1	Acharya Nagarjuna University	3	1.69
2	Aligarh Muslim University	2	1.13
3	Andhra University	7	3.95
4	Anna University	1	0.56
5	Assam University	en Trail Seas	0.56
6	Avanashilingam Institute for Home Science and Higher Education for Women	1	0.56
7	Awadesh Pratap Singh University	3	1.69
g	Banaras Hindu University	1	0.56
)	Bangalore University	5	2.82
10	Barkatullah Viswavidyalaya	1	0.56
11	Bhavnagar University	3	1.69
12	Bhupendra Narayan Mandal University	2	1.13
13	Chhatrapati Shahu Ji Maharaj University	3	1.69
14	Cochin University of Science and Technology	2	1.13
15	Devi Ahilya Vishwavidyalaya	4	2.26
6	Dibrugarh University	2	1.13
17	Dr Babasaheb Ambedkar Marathwada University	13	7.34
18	Dr Harisingh Gour Vishwavidyalaya	1	0.56
19	Gandhigram Rural University	3	1.69
20	Gauhati University	2	1.13
21	Guru Jambheshwar University of Science and Technology	3	1.69
22	Guru Nanak Dev University	dia 1 horse	0.56
23	Hemachandracharya North Gujarat University	1	0.56
24	Indian Institute of Technology Delhi	3	1.69
25	Indian School of Mines	1	0.56
6	Jamia Milia Islamia University	4	2.26
7	Jawaharlal Nehru University	2	1.13
28	Kakatiya University	- Sac - Polyers	0.56
19	Karnatak State Women's University	1	0.56
10	Karnatak University	8	4.52
31	Kurukshetra University	4	2.26
12	Kuvempu University	4	2.26
13	Maharaja Sayajirao University of Baroda	of the I	0.56
4	Maharana Pratap University of Agriculture & Technology	2	1.13
5	Maharshi Dayanand University	2	1.13
6	Mahatma Jyotiba Phule Rohikhand University	por di 1	0.56
7	Manipur University	5	2.82
8	Manonmaniam Sundaranar University	3	1.69
19	Mizoram University	2	1.13

Sl. No.	Name of the University	No. of Theses	Percentage
40	North Eastern Hill University	The state of	0.56
41	North Maharashtra University	1	0.56
42	Osmania University	10	5.65
43	Panjab University	1	0.56
44	Pondicherry University	3	1.69
45	Punjab Agricultural University	2	1.13
46	Punjabi University	3	1.69
47	Rani Durgavati Vishwavidyalaya	dell'alle de la company	2.26
48	Rayalaseema University	2	1.13
49	Saurashtra University	3	1.69
50	Shivaji University	5	2.82
51	Shri Jagdishprasad Jhabarmal Tibrewala University	1	0.56
52	Sikkim Manipal University of Health, Medical and Technological Sciences	1	0.56
53	South Gujarat University	1	0.56
54	Swami Ramanand Teerth Marathwada University	3	1.69
55	Tata Institute of Social Sciences	2	1.13
56	Tezpur University	1	0.56
57	Tripura University	1	0.56
58	University of Calcutta	1	0.56
59	University of Hyderabad	1	0.56
60	University of Kashmir	1	0.56
61	University of Kerala	Samuel 4: seri	2.26
62	University of Lucknow	4	2.26
63	University of Pune	Seeding to Localist	0.56
64	Utkal University	8	4.52
65	Vikram University	2	1.13
66	Vinoba Bhave University	1	0.56
	Total	177	100.00

of universities have contributed towards the research in Entrepreneurship. The university names are given in alphabetical order.

Dr. Babasaheb Ambedkar Marathwada University, Aurangabad has awarded highest Ph.D theses, i.e. 13 (7.34%) followed by Osmania University, Hyderabad 10 theses (5.65%). The data show that twenty six universities awarded only one Ph.D each on entrepreneurship. Eight theses (4.53%) each were awarded by Karnatak University and Utkal University.

# State Wise Distribution of Ph.D Theses on Entrepreneurship

Table 4 shows the state wise distribution of theses on Entrepreneurship. Out of 29 states and 7 union territories in India, 24 states and one union territory (Puducherry) have awarded Ph.D in Entrepreneurship. It shows that 66.67% of states/union territories are encouraging research in Entrepreneurship. The states are arranged in alphabetical order. It can be observed that the universities of Maharashtra have awarded the highest number of 25 Ph.Ds (14.12%), while the universities of Jammu & Kashmir, Meghalaya, Sikkim,

Tripura and West Bengal have awarded one Ph.D cach which is the lowest. States like Karnataka, Madhya Pradesh, Andhra Pradesh, Telangana and Uttar Pradesh have awarded more than 10 Ph.Ds on entrepreneurship.

Table 4. State Wise Distribution of Ph.D Theses on Entrepreneurship

St.No.	Name of the State N	lo, of Theses	Percentage
1	Maharashtra	25	14.12
2	Karnataka	18	10.17
3	Madhya Pradesh	15	8.47
4	Andhra Pradesh	12	6.78
5	Telangana	12	6.78
6	Uttar Pradesh	11	6.21
7	Delhi	9	5.08
8	Gujarat	9	5.08
9	Haryana	9	5.08
10	Odisha	8	4.52
11	Tamilnadu	8	4.52
d'a	Punjab	7	3.95
13 5	Assam	6	3.39
14	Kerala	6	3.39
15	Manipur	5	2.82
16	Puducherry (Union Territor	y) 3	1.69
17	Rajasthan	3	1.69
18	Bihar	2	1.13
19	Jharkhand	2	1.13
20	Mizoram	2	1.13
21	Jammu & Kashmir	1	0.56
22	Meghayala	1	0.56
23	Sikkim	1	0.56
24	Tripura	1	0.56
25	West Bengal	1	0.56
THE .	Total	177	100.00

# Gender Wise Distribution of Ph.D Theses on Entrepreneurship

Table 5 shows the gender wise distribution of theses on entrepreneurship in various Indian universities. It can be observed that the contribution to entrepreneurship research by female is larger. The table reveals that 58.76 percentage of entrepreneurship research has been done by male researchers and whereas 41.24 percentage by female researchers.

Table 5. Gender Wise Distribution of PhD Theses on Entrepreneurship

SI. No.	Sex of Researcher	No. of Theses	Percentage
1	Male	104	58.76
2	Female	73	41.24
ni ora	Total	177	100

#### Language Wise Distribution of Ph.D Theses

It can be observed in Table 6 that research work has been done in different languages. However most of the theses in entrepreneurship have been carried out in English language (94.35%) while ten doctoral theses (5.67%) have been done in national language i.e., Hindi.

Table 6. Language Wise Distribution of PhD Theses

Sl. No.	Language of Theses	No. of Theses	Percentage
1	English	167	94.35
2	Hindi	10	5.65
PORTION A	Total	177	100

#### **Key Observations**

The following observations were made on the basis of the findings of the study:

- The distribution of Ph.D theses indicates that there
  is an increase in theses submission during 2000 to
  2002. It is quite interesting to note that in 2007, 16
  researchers submitted their theses on
  entrepreneurship. The study reveals that
  entrepreneurship research is showing an upward
  trend over the years.
- The percentage of Ph.D theses in entrepreneurship as compared to social science disciplines is very discouraging. Research in entrepreneurship is 14.31 per cent of those that have been submitted in the social sciences during the last sixteen years. Entrepreneurship research is not progressing as other disciplines of social science. Much more concentration needs to be given to ensure development of the subject.
- Out of 740 universities in India only 66 universities have awarded Ph.D in entrepreneurship.

40 universities each have awarded a Ph.D to more than one thesis, whereas 26 universities have awarded to one each.

- The Ph.D theses submission across the states reflects that Maharashtra has contributed much towards the research in entrepreneurship, followed by Karnataka, Madhya Pradesh, Andhra Pradesh, Telangana and Uttar Pradesh. Jammu & Kashmir, Meghalaya, Sikkim, Tripura and West Bengal show less attention to entrepreneurship research.
- Although entrepreneurship movement began in Gujarat, it is unfortunate to note that the universities of Gujarat have contributed only 9 (5.08%) Ph.D theses in entrepreneurship which shows research entrepreneurship is not encouraged by universities in Gujarat.
- From the primary data, it has been observed that more research on women entrepreneurship (70 Ph.D theses) has been carried out.

#### Suggestions

Based on the key findings of the study, following suggestions are proposed to encourage doctoral education and research in the field of Entrepreneurship in India:

- Indian universities should increase the availability of Ph.D. programs and concentrate in providing methodological education, training and research in entrepreneurship.
- Faculty Development Programs on Entrepreneurship should be conducted to impart the faculties with requisite skills, knowledge and competencies for effective initiation of Entrepreneurship Orientation Courses in their colleges.
- Entrepreneurship should be taught as a core subject in post graduate programmes of various disciplines so that students can be geared up for taking entrepreneurship as a career option.
- As there is a derth of experts/Ph.D. Guides in the domain of entrepreneurship, collaborative industryacademia mentorship support should be arranged for scholars in Entrepreneurship.
- Doctoral program in Entrepreneurship can be promoted as a platform to connect researchers with startups who are keen on conducting market research for business opportunity identification, business plan preparation and other important areas of starting up an enterprise.

 Department of doctoral research can establish linkages with existing corporate and family business enterprises so that opportunities for evidence based research can be explored. This can be used to overcome the divide between knowledge developed in the field of entrepreneurship and its use in practice.

# **Directions for Future Research**

Entrepreneurship as an area of study is gaining momentum gradually and the discipline is moving towards academic legitimization. But there is a wide road to be travelled in the area of entrepreneurial research and doctoral education. This paper highlights the growth and development of entrepreneurship research in Indian Universities for the last sixteen years. Though the current study identifies Women Entrepreneurship as the most preferred area of research, further research can be done to identify other areas in which doctoral dissertations are done in Indian Universities. Gender-wise interest areas can also be mapped and studied to find out the impact of gender on the choice of topic for a doctoral dissertation. As the entire country is geared up for entrepreneurial movement, state level entrepreneurship policies can be studied. Research implications can be drawn by comparing those policies with the number and type of Ph.D. dissertations undertaken in different states.

#### References

- Aldrich, H. and Baker, T. (1997). Blinded by the Cites? Has there been progress in entrepreneurship research? In D. L. Sexton, and R. W. Smilor, Entrepreneurship (pp. 377-400). Chicao: Upstart Publishing.
- Association of Indian Universities. (2010). Universities handbook. 32nd ed. New Delht; AIU (32 ed.). New Delhi: AIU.
- Association of Indian Universities. (2010). University News. 2000-2010. New Delhi: AIU.
- Batthini, G. (2011). Doctoral Education in the Field of Entrepreneurship in India, IIM, Ahmedabad. Conference on Strategies for Managing Libraries in the Future (pp. 365-385). New Delhi: Bookwell.
- Batthini, G. (2012). Research in Entrepreneurship: Doctoral Dissertations in India during 2000-2008. In A. K. Dwivedi, and A. Sukhwal (Eds.). New Delhi: Bookwell.
- Batthini, G. and Tripathy, J. (2005). Entrepreneurship Research in Indian Universities. Sixth Biennial Conference on Advances and Trends in Entrepreneurship Research. Ahmedabad: EDII.

- Borse, M. (2004). Handbook of research methodology: Modern, methods and new techniques. Jaipur: Srimiyas Publications.
- Brockhaus, R. (1991). Entrepreneurship education and research outside North America. Entrepreneurship Theory and Practice, 15(3), 77-84.
- Duhaime, I., and Hitt, M. (June 2000). The State of Doctoral Education in Entrepreneurship. 20th Annual Babson Entrepreneurship Research Conference. Boston.
- Fayolle, A. (2010). Handbook of research in entrepreneurship education (3 vols.). Cheltanham: Edward Elgar.
- Gartner, W. and Vesper, K. (1994). Experiments in Entrepreneurship Education: Successes and Failures. Journal of Business Venturing, 9(3), 179-187.
- Hitt, M. and Ireland, R. (2000). The Intersection of Entrepreneurship and Strategic Management Research. In L. Sexton and H. Landstrom (Eds.), Handbook of Entrepreneurship (pp. 45-63). Oxford: Blackwell Publishers.
- Joshi, R. and Batthini, G. (2008). Current Status of SMEs and Entrepreneurship Education and Training Intervention in Select South and South-East Asian Countries. The ICFAI Journal of Entrepreneurship Development, 5(1), 35-60.
- Plaschka, G and Welsch, H. (1990). Emerging Structures in Entrepreneurship Education: Curricular Designs and Strategies. Entrepreneurship: Theory & Practice, 14(3), 55-71.
- Sexton, D. and Landstrom, H. (2000). Introduction. In D. Sexton and H. Landstrom (Eds.), Handbook of Entrepreneurshlp (pp. xix-xxiv). Oxford: Blackwell Publishing.
- Urbano, D., Aponte, M. and Toledano, N. (2008). Ductoral Education in Entrepreneurship: A European Case Study. Journal of Small Business and Enterprise Development, 15(2), 336-347.
- Vesper, K. and Gartner, W. (1997). Measuring Progress in Entrepreneurship Education. *Journal of Business Venturing*, 12(5), 403-421.
- Vesper, K. and McMullan, W. (1988). Entrepreneurship: Today Courses, Tomorrow Degrees? Entrepreneurship Theory & Practice, 13(1), 7-13

### Appendix

# A List of Doctoral Theses on Entrepreneurship Accepted by Indian Universities during 2000 to 2015

Year: 2000

 Ashok Kumar, S. Entrepreneurial success in small scale industries. (Prof E G Parameswaran), Department of Commerce, Osmania University, Hyderabad.

- Babu Rao, Gangaraju. Support systems for accelerating entrepreneurship among technically qualified persons with reference to Andhra Pradesh. (Prof V Madan Mohan Reddy), Department of Management, Osmania University, Hyderabad.
- Deolankar, Vivek Shankarrao. Small scale entrepreneurship in India: retrospect and prospects. Department of Commerce, Dr Babasaheb Ambedkar Marathwada University, Aurangabad.
- Deshpande, M S. Study of women entrepreneurship in Marathwada. (Dr J V Joshi), Department of Management, Swami Ramanand Teerth Marathwada University, Nanded.
- Ongon'ga, Jared Opiyo. Kenyan entrepreneurship. (Dr M U Deshpande), Department of Management, Dr Bahasaheb Ambedkar Marathwada University. Aurangabad.
- Panda, Nagari Mohan. Development of entrepreneurship in Nagaland with a special reference to hotel enterprises.
   (Dr B B Pradhan), Department of Commerce, Manipur University, Imphal.

#### Year: 2001

- Balaraju, T. Entrepreneurship development in Andhra Pradesh: an analytical study. (Prof O Ghanshayam Das), Department of Commerce, Kakatiya University, Warangal.
- Borkakoty, Aparajeeta. Institutional marketing of entrepreneurship programmes: a study of its impact on women entrepreneurs of Assam. (Dr Nayan Barua), Department of Commerce, Gauhati University, Guwahati.
- Dhameja, Suresh Kumar. A study of entrepreneurial performance and problems of women in business in the States of Punjab, Haryana and Union Territory of Chandigarh (Dr B S Bhatia and Dr J S Saini), Department of Management, Punjabi University, Patiala.
- Hothur Mohammad, P. Entrepreneurship and structural dynamics among handlooms weavers in Andhra Pradesh. (Dr Siva Prasad), Department of Anthropology, University of Hyderabad, Hyderabad.
- Kasi Reddy, M. The role of institutional agencies in promoting entrepreneurship development among Scheduled Caste and ST in Andhra Pradesh. (Prof D Obul Reddy), Department of Commerce, Osmania University, Hyderabad.
- Mohanty, Jyotsna. The snake charmers women as small scale entrepreneurs: a study of tradition and its changing perspectives. (Prof P K Nayak), Department of Anthropology, Utkal University, Bhubaneswar.
- Pandit, Narahar Sukhdev. A Critical study of entrepreneurship development in Satara with special reference to MIDC Satara. (Dr P S Rao), Department of Commerce, University of Pune, Pune.